Quality Management in Taiwan Local Police Departments
--Examples of “Government Service Award” Winners

Will Shyh-nan Kao 1

Introduction

Ever since the rise of “New Public Management” (NPM) in multiple countries, significant changes have taken place in government administration. The roles of government have transformed from being the dictator and manager to being the facilitator and service provider. The transition aims to turn the bureaucratic, authoritarian style and passive democratic system into a more efficient, responsive, and customer-oriented model. Modern public administrators propose to learn from the examples of business management and apply innovative management tools to complete tasks based on the public’s needs. Besides the improvement in efficiency and effectiveness, it is hoped to further create better qualities and values. Therefore, “Total Quality Management” (TQM) was introduced to the government to enhance public service quality for citizens.

Influenced by the new public management trend, governments at all levels in the United States have implemented TQM and the federal government set up Federal Quality Institute to promote such movement. Its performance has been one of the key milestones in “Reinventing Government” movement. The U.S. police agencies also began service quality reform by promoting “Quality Policing”. A couple of well-received examples were the service quality improvement at the police departments in Brighton, Colorado and Madison, Wisconsin.

Taiwan Government began to introduce the idea and approach of new public management since 1990s. In 1996, Research, Development, and Evaluation Commission, Executive Yuan (RDEC) in Taiwan brought the business concepts of “Total Quality Management” and “Customer-oriented Service” to improve government service quality. “Total Service Quality Enhancement Plan” and “Executive Yuan Service Quality Award” were created to establish service prototype and quality standard. In 2007, RDEC proposed “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” as the succeeding plan to promote public service quality and lead the transformation to a service-oriented government by referencing the “Good Governance” concept. Although Taiwan police agencies started late on service quality reform, local police departments have followed Executive Yuan’s policies in recent years to improve their services. The police departments in Taoyuan County, Taichung County, Hsinchu City, and Taitung County were the recipients of 1st to 4th “Government Service Quality Award”, respectively.

Therefore, this article aims to study the quality management in local police departments using the aforementioned examples. The differences, performances, and pros and cons between the award winners in Taiwan are discussed. The article further illustrates the service reform implemented by U.S. police agencies and the results are compared to those in Taiwan. This study, combined with the principle of “Good Governance”, would allow us to evaluate the performances of service improvement policies by two countries and suggest possible improvements.

1 The Author is Director, Department of Regional Affairs, Research, Development and Evaluation Commission, Executive Yuan; Lecturer, Central Police University; Doctoral student, Institute of Police Policy, Central Police University.
Quality Policing in America

1. The Principles and Strategies of Total Quality Management of the Federal Government in America

In the late 1980s, American enterprises were seeking for the coping strategies to confront economy recession and intense competition from international market; Total Quality Management was paid much attention in the stream valuing Japanese management. It became the important approach for modern organization to improve productivity and quality of service in just a few years by the competing research or implementation in academics and had a significant influence in the management of American enterprises and government departments.

Since 1998, the federal government has followed the concept of total quality management in private sectors and amended it to make it applicable in public sectors. Besides, the federal government sets Federal Quality Institute to implement Total Quality Management and makes it as the important landmark of reinventing government. Total Quality Management implemented by the federal government also adopts some principles prevalent in private sectors. The ultimate purpose is to increase (the publics’) customers’ satisfaction: 1. Taking increasing people’s satisfaction as the important objects of governance. 2. Continuous improvement of the process and result of governance. 3. Taking appropriate steps to ensure that all government servants are able to get involved in quality improvement. Therefore, the essence of Total Quality Management is to make each one in the organization could deeply involving and being empowered in order to continuously improve service or properties, and further pursue people’s satisfaction. (孫本初, 2005:106, 107).

Furthermore, the federal government integrates seven practical steps to form a strategy for implementing Total Quality Management. The purpose is to initiate a government radical change which is also called reinventing government (Federal Quality Institute, 1991:4-13): top management leadership and support; strategic planning; focus on the customer; measurement and analysis; training and recognition; employee empowerment and teamwork; quality assurance.

Federal Quality Institute simultaneously set the president’s Quality Award in 1988. The awardees are the federal government organizations, at least including 500 full-time staff, implementing quality management for 3 to 6 years and obtaining the concrete achievements. The two most excellent organizations are awarded each year. The purpose for this award aims at selecting the most excellent government organization with the best demonstration effects of implementing quality management in order to achieve high quality government service, effectively take advantage of people’s taxes and further advance all of federal governments sectors could implement quality management. (江岷欽, 林鍾沂, 1999:445) The Criteria for the Award is shown in table1.
## Table 1: Criteria for the President’s Quality Award (U.S.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Points</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Leadership</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Administrative leadership</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Quality management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Public responsibility and citizenship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information and Analysis</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Measurement of organizational performance</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Comparisons between similar suppliers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Analysis of organizational performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategic Planning</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Strategy development</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Strategy deployment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human Resource Focus</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Work systems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Employee participation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Employee education and development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Employee performance and reward</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Employee well being and satisfaction</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process Management</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Product and service designs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Product and service processes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Support processes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Supplier and partnering processes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Quality measurements</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business Results</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Product and service results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Organizational effectiveness results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Support processes results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Supplier and partner results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Customer Focus</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Customer and market knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Customer relationships</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Commitment to the customers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Customer satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Customer-focused results</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


2. **Case Study on Quality Policing of American Police Agencies**

With the impact of Total Quality Management strongly taken by American federal government, several police agencies also start to take this movement, which is so called “Quality Policing”, in order to reform the quality of policing service. However, American police agencies’ management traditionally adopt quasi-military training and management, often taking banning or interfering as the means to interact with the public, which could cause the implementation of quality management a great deal of difficulty. Hence, the successful cases are not many. Some famous examples like Colorado Brighton City and Wisconsin Madison City police departments, their service quality obtained great achievements.
Since 1985-1990, the Brighton Police Department had reformed policing by Total Service Quality (TSQ). TSQ is directed at the intangible ingredients of the delivery process of a service. “Total” refers to the fact that all members of the organization must be 100 percent committed to quality in the delivery of services and that each member must place customer satisfaction as the top priority, the ultimate goal. “Service” means customer-driven performance - that is, the customer, not the police officer, determines what is desirable and needed. This is a major turnaround for law enforcement. A customer-driven organization is concerned with performance rather than production. “Quality” is the antithesis waste and errors. Each member must perform the service right the first time, and the service must be satisfactory to the customer. Quality service is determined by three simple questions at the moment of truth: (1) Is it efficient? (2) Is it effective? (3) Is it satisfactory? (Galloway, 1992:459,460)

Many reforms were implemented by the then newly appointed police chief, Robert A. Galloway. The most significant issue that became the focal point of change was the organization’s legalistic philosophy. First of all, to rectify a “people problem”, the police department hired an organizational development consultant to evaluate the operations of the organization with a focus on the interpersonal relationships between citizens and employees-at the moment of truth, where the product, police service, was perceived by the customers, the community’s citizens. The police department implemented quality reform project based on the opinions of the community’s citizens. On the one hand, the department adopted the classic model for changing organizational structure through behavior modification. Each employee was given seventy-two hours of training to develop cultural awareness, sensitivity, and interpersonal skills, and to build self-confidence and self-esteem. On the other hand, the police department modified its mission statement, management philosophy and community relationship statement to include the concept of the customers being right and made a policy of satisfactory conclusions to each business transaction. The police department systematically identified and addressed some management barriers against new philosophy. It also modified its annual performance evaluation to include service quality and overhauled the entrance-level training program to accommodate the new philosophy and recruitment standards for police officers. Accordingly, the Brighton Police Department transformed itself from a "social regulator" into a "social facilitator.” It became a one-stop service in city government (Galloway, 1992:455-457).

The police chief decided to change the way of recruitment in view of the difficulties to convert some routine practices and the expensive cost and time-consuming for the training and retraining. The department decided to hire service-oriented recruits and train them to be cops,

---

2 The consultant identified four specific problems with police officers. They (1) were aggressive, not assertive; (2) generally held themselves in low self-esteem; (3) lacked interpersonal skills; and (4) had an attitude problem. Galloway, 1992:455.

3 The chief tried to find a solution of the attitude problem by discussing the issue with fifteen service-oriented businesses. This search identified many approaches to the problem, which can be divided into three groups: (1) Termination on first complaint; (2) Sending employees to remedial training; (3) Training in how to handle difficult employees. The above training would produce the desired result, that is, satisfied customers. Galloway, 1992:456.
rather than hire cops and train them to be service-oriented employees. The Brighton Police Department has overcome that handicap and has been successful with the private-sector approach to quality. Its employees are outstanding service-oriented performer so that they could try new service delivery strategies, such as community-oriented policing, etc (Galloway, 1992:457,458).

The police department further used Total Service Quality and Total Quality Management. Since 1991 it developed a guarantee for its service by again borrowing from the private sector, which uses guarantees of product reliability, to accomplish three purposes: (1) It states organizational values and, thus, provides citizens with a complete understanding of their police department and what they can expect from it. (2) It encourages feedback from the customer on how well the department is meeting the citizens’ expectations. This feedback enables the department to assess its delivery system and make necessary adjustments. (3) It holds employees accountable for meeting minimum performance standards and ensuring that customers receive good service (Galloway, 1992:458).

The police department uses several measurement devices for quality management. According to the results of this informal poll, which is mailed monthly from the chief to crime victims, traffic offenders, and those who received noncriminal service, over the past four years show an overall satisfaction level of 97 percent (Ibid.). Secondly, the police department also employs some methods, including an internal questionnaire to measure its employees’ job satisfaction periodically, a method recognized by the law enforcement community as acceptable indicators of performance, serious internal investigations, the number of lawsuits, the state of media relations, and budgetary support from and relations with the city council, to evaluate its performance. The customer satisfaction surveys for the past two years (1990-1991) show that 98 percent of respondents believe the police do a good job serving the community. Complaints to the city council have dropped from thirty-two in the first year to zero. None are now being registered with the city manager or the chief of police. Internal investigations have dropped from fifteen in the first year to one in 1991, and this was generated from within, not from the customer. Turnover is down from 45 percent to 7 percent, and morale is very high because productivity is up. No lawsuits have been filed against the police department and no claims settled as a result of police misconduct for the past six years. The Brighton City Council unanimously approves the police department’s annual budget and is always open to new programs and mid-year adjustments. This indicates faith and confidence in the department and satisfaction with performance. Similarly, the media treat the police favorably and with respect (Galloway, 1992:460,461).

In short, the Brighton City Police Department had implemented the three major strategies of Total Service Quality, including the establishment of a service-oriented work value, the

---

4 In seeking ways to achieve continuous improvement, the department has discovered a fascinating trend: It appears that the new breed of quality-oriented police officers does not have serious marital problems: Their divorce rate is significantly lower than that of the old hires. It also solves an occupational hazard among police officers. Galloway, 1992:461.
training of an interpersonal community, and the establishment of the attitude of self-respect, for six years. The conditions for its success included well-trained, high-quality communication grassroots police officers, leading cadres, with high quality, are willing to authorize and participate in the design of human-based management, and appeal of the police to improve service quality and review their new positions (陳明傳，2000:38、39). This case study supports the notion that private-sector TQM and TSQ business techniques can be successfully applied to any government service-oriented organization (Galloway, 1992:461).

"Quality Policing" in the Madison City Police Department

From 1980 to 1990, the Madison City Police Department spent ten years reforming the police department by quality policing. This reform was driven by the then police chief David C. Couper. His identity in the Quality Movement was the new ideas and new trends which are effective for the business community and the police sector: a commitment to people, the development of a people-oriented workplace, and the belief that leadership can and does make a difference. Thus on the new leadership style it is important that police managers be committed to treating their employees well in order to retain them and ensure that they will, in turn, follow this example in their dealing with the public. Meanwhile, new leadership styles in the police organization not only achieved high quality policing, but also assisted in community policing, problem-solving policing and other sports. (Couper & Lobitz, 1991:5,12)

Police prepare implementation practices of quality policing include: 1. establishing the Officer's Advisory Council, composed of 12 peer-selected employees, participating and assisting in policy formulation of decision-making levels; 2. setting Committee on the Future of the Department, composed of the seniorities with at least 15-years experiences, continuing to study and forecast the future trends of organizations in order to propose proactive response measures; 3. the reform of quality policing and the reforms of administrative quality and productivity proposed by city government became a powerful combination. 4. a mission statement developed in 1986 defines the common values and ideals of the police department that required the police should provide high-quality and community-oriented services to all citizens; For internal parts, police’s needs satisfaction and working environments should be cared to promote the management team to improve the entire process, interpersonal relations and team building. 5. Six Neighborhood Patrol Bureaus were established in 1985, besides patrolling by foot to shorten the distance between the police and people, also giving police an area and responsibilities of problem-solving, requesting them to be the community organizers, resource persons and

---

5 In the early 1970s, with the appointment of a new chief, the Madison police were prompted to shed their old role of “enforcer” and take on the role of “peacekeeper”. This was accompanied by a movement toward community-oriented policing and greater citizen participation in the police department. Although community relations improved as a result of the changes, relations with the police union did not. In 1981, the chief, Couper, decided to take on some of the department’s internal problems. He discussed with rank-and-file officers on how to improve the department convinced the chief that he had to consider a new approach to running the department. He decided to let employees participate more in organizational decisions and to take on for himself the role of facilitator within the department. Couper & Lobitz, 1991:15-17.
coordinator to help people improve their total life quality in the community. 6. the program of
the Experimental Police District planned in 1986 was made through the constantly investigation
and analysis of the demands of the police and people, and the research of experimental contents
and related factors by project planning group which is in order to plan a pattern of quality
management in experimental district. Finally, in early 1988, experimental contents districts and
the selection of personnel involved in the experiments of the district were determined.

During the implementation of the quality policing, the city police chief not only focused on
the use of quality leadership principles, but put theory into practice, including the total support
of top managers, the modification of leadership style in response to the police and the public
demands, the new ways to train the new and old employees, the creation of future vision, the use
of quality coordinator, the establishment of quality leadership committee, ongoing customer
surveys, the recruitment of external coaches and mentors, the processing of organizational
 reform, restructuring team, the implementation of walking around management, the regular
inspection of leaderships and so on(Couper & Lobitz, 1991:45-81). After these methods
successively implemented, the police from the investigation of two years experiment in police
experimental district found out that when changing the management pattern of internal
organization and the strategy of serving people, over 60% of the employees in the experimental
district believed they had been more effective in solving crimes than in their previous
assignment, over 80 percent of them reported a higher level of job satisfaction compared with
previous assignments, and people’ s satisfaction continuously increased as well (Couper &

Based on the reform experience of Madison Police Department, its three main principles
were: 1. colleagues in the organization must have common consensus and recognition, expecting
to achieve the goal of improving the quality of administration; 2. organization must change as
the environment and new needs, should not be rigid; 3. must face the changes within the
organization by proactive response to meet people’s needs. The five important conditions for the
success of organization reforms are: 1. having a clear vision of where you are going; 2. having a
strong, unyielding commitment from the chief executive; 3. empowering employees and
permitting them to participate in the direction and decisions of the organization; 4. developing
the skills and abilities of leaders as well as employees in the organization and continually
training them; 5. operating the organization for the long-term with persistence and patience

Quality Management in Taiwan Local Police Departments

1. History and Practice of Public Services in Taiwan

To improve administrative service quality, the Executive Yuan promulgated “Directions for
Promoting the Public Services Provided by All Levels of Government”, “Directions for
Improving Service Quality and Service Attitude at the Counters of Administrative Agencies”,
and formed “Supervisory Committee for the Executive Yuan’s Goal of Improving Public Services” since the 1970s. During that time span the top-down approach was adopted to plan, coordinate, and evaluate tasks that serve the people. In the 1980s and 1990s, this concept further evolved and both “Directions of Reward and Punishment for Evaluating the Public Services provided by the Executive Yuan and its Subordinate Authorities” and “Directions for Enhancing the Public Services Provided by the Executive Yuan and its Subordinate Authorities” were promulgated. The Premier of the Executive Yuan has since been openly recognizing those agencies which excelled in annual service evaluation and hopefully the reward system would propel service innovations (廖麗娟、黃子華, 2012：16).

The Research, Development and Evaluation Commission (RDEC) of the Executive Yuan began to introduce new ideas and approaches from advanced countries since 1996 and brought the business concepts of “Total Quality Management” and “Customer-oriented Service” to improve government service quality. “Total Service Quality Enhancement Plan” and “Executive Yuan Service Quality Award” were created to establish service prototype and quality standard. By referencing the “Good Governance” concept, RDEC proposed “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” in 2007 as the succeeding plan to improve public service quality and lead the transformation to a digital, innovative, and service-oriented government (何沙崙, 2007：4 - 6).

Guided by the concept of “Good Governance”, the government’s responsibility to serve the people is reemphasized and a legitimate task-sharing system with public engagement is established. Current reform goals include “continually promoting services that satisfy people”, “protecting the integrity of people’s rights to know and use information”, and “encouraging agencies to provide innovative and integrated services”. Key principles are: 1. from individual performance to overall performance; 2. from executive performance to strategic planning performance; 3. from process-oriented indicators to result-oriented indicators; 4. from quality management to quality reinvention. Therefore, the “Executive Yuan Service Quality Award” recognizes both the agencies serving in the front line and agencies doing service planning. For front-line agencies, the evaluation is based on overall performances, including standard services, information services, and innovative value-added services. For service planning agencies, the evaluation is judged by project-based performances which focus on the quality of overall planning and the novelty of strategies. Key measures for “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” are attached in table 2 (Ibid: 6-8).

Table 2 : Implementation Measures for Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementation Measures</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improve Service Quality and Productivity</td>
<td>1. Upgrade the service locations and renew the amenities for the convenience; increase the practicality of public services provided to the civilians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Build a professional, enthusiastic, and responsible image for public servants who proactively assist, guide, and offer consultations to the civilians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Utilize the media to hold public hearings, info sessions, and community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
meetings to promote the government agenda and demonstrate implementation results with the aid of target marketing strategies.
4. Coordinate with enterprises and social groups to initiate or attend volunteer events to expand the government’s impact.
5. Promote government services to earn the recognitions from civilians and awards.

**Streamline Service Procedures and Ensure a Clear System**

| 1. | Set up multifunctional counters to provide one-stop services; improve the coherence of agencies; demand higher application handling skills from the counter personnel; balance the workload between counters to reduce civilians’ waiting time. |
| 2. | Simplify the procedures such as minimizing the processing time and required application forms; set up better operating procedures and performance indicators to help establish a standardized operating framework. |
| 3. | Reexamine the necessity of hard copies required for applications; work toward the goal of increasing the usage of electronic documents during the certification process. |
| 4. | Publicize the information regarding standard service procedures; request each agency to provide an online inquiry system for civilians to check their latest application status while ensuring that the neither Freedom of Information Act nor Personal Information Privacy Act would be breached. |

**Observe National Polls and Establish Customer Relationship**

| 1. | Establish a timely and effective mechanism to deal with public complaints; minimize the number of occasions and reduce the time required to handle such events. |
| 2. | Open up communication channels for civilians to provide suggestions; manage public issues in a careful, efficient, lawful, and accurate fashion. |
| 3. | Promote a prompt response protocol to defend policies or correct mistaken reports by the media. |
| 4. | Create a FAQ system to collect public opinions and potentially convert them into future service policies or measures. |
| 5. | Conduct polls periodically, analyze the results, and improve service quality; design better survey questions and develop more accurate result evaluations; mirror similar agencies to discover area for improvement. |

**Enhance Service Information and Promote Communications through the Internet**

| 1. | Publicize basic information, core policies, implementation plans, service agendas, and budget decisions of public agencies through valid, constantly updating links. |
| 2. | Ensure that all public websites follow international standards, including the provision of advanced and categorical search engine. |
| 3. | Establish a friendly and diversified internet environment with tools such as message boards, forums, online voting, and online polls. |
| 4. | Promote online services and applications, provide complete information and security authentication, and expand the scope of online case handling. |
| 5. | Encourage the setup of interagency information platforms to increase resource sharing and raise efficiency. |

**Provide Innovative and Integrated Services**

| 1. | Reemphasize self-examination, discover issues with current services, reform government work flows, introduce resources from the private sector, apply the latest information technologies, and propose innovative and comprehensive measures. |
| 2. | Reexamine the breadth and depth of services provided to civilians; consolidate overlapped or relevant tasks to redesign value-added services which pinpoint civilians’ needs. |
| 3. | Focus on service objectives and outcomes; provide innovative and diversified services; lower the costs and improve service quality to demonstrate social justice and public values. |
| 4. | Urge all agencies to break the existing barriers and maximize resource sharing through interagency horizontal or vertical consolidations. |

2. Case Study on Quality Management in Taiwan Local Police Departments

The police system in Taiwan originally inherited the top-down centralized police system from Mainland China. It focused more on crime control and law enforcement while lacking the service mentality (陳明傳，2000：42；王國明，1997：183；內政部警政署，2002). Some police departments even considered service as a “shared burden. Moreover, the police organizations had been very structured and bureaucratic as agencies at each level rarely went extra miles to provide services (朱金池，1999：356). This passiveness had hindered the promotion of services at the basic level.

Taiwan police agencies started late on service quality reform and few measures were implemented in early years. For example, Yu-chun Lu, former Chief of National Police Agency, emphasized “Security, Service, and Discipline“ and detailed measures included shortening service wait time, visiting community neighbors, and conducting surveys (盧毓鈞，1994：1、4-6). From 2002 to 2005, National Police Agency promoted the “Instruction Plan for Promoting Police Institutions’ Adoption of ISO Quality Management System and Certification”. A total of 153 local police departments, along with two from offshore islands Kinmen and Lienchiang, introduced the “ISO9001” quality management system. According to academic research, the plan helped improve the hardware and process management of the police departments. However, more actions would have to be taken to improve the training system for police personnel and to build commitments of leadership (李湧清、黃啟賓，2007：253-281).

In recent years, Taiwan police agencies have been following the Executive Yuan’s guidance and policies to promote quality services. The police departments in Taoyuan County, Taichung County, Hsinchu City, and Taitung County were the recipients of 1st to 4th “Government Service Quality Award”, respectively. Since all these police departments followed “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” to improve their services, the winner each year quickly became the benchmark and the methods adopted throughout the years resembled each other. The case studies of the four award-winning departments are broken down to the following categories:

*Senior Leadership*

The promotion of public services by the four police departments was led by their chiefs to propose strategic plans and form workgroups. The senior police executives and leaders of competent authorities all participated to maximize the overall performances.

*Strategic Planning*

All four police departments came up with their visions, missions, goals, and strategies. However, only Taitung County Police Department performed SWOT analysis to evaluate the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats and proposed strategies that meet the local needs.
1. Public Services

All four police departments basically followed the five key measures specified in “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” and their services covered front-line executions, public security enforcement, traffic maintenance, women and children’s safety, elderly care, and services for the disabled. Furthermore, there were several innovative approaches, such as: mobile police department and off-campus patrols by Taoyuan County Police Department; land conservation efforts, distribution process for shopping vouchers, and the promotion of police reporting system through text messages for the deaf by Taichung County Police Department; the 2nd generation emergency reporting system, cross-district police governance, and anti-speeding cameras by Hsinchu City Police Department; on-site pickups of application form for police criminal record certificate, information gathering at the scenes of the accidents, fingerprinting for elderly with dementia, training of domestic violence prevention officers, 24-hour foreigner assistance hotline, and helping the aboriginal peoples acquire their driver licenses by Taitung County Police Department.

2. Innovative Services

All four police departments proposed innovative strategies individually, as described below:

(1) Taoyuan County Police Department: three consecutive years of winning national awards, 3G police assignment system, video surveillance system, smooth traffic project, community participation and communication.

(2) Taichung County Police Department: ICOS police reporting system, risk assessment and safety evaluation for students renting off-campus, markings for agricultural machines to prevent thefts, bike rangers, trial run for electronic patrol system, integrated system to recover stolen goods, markings for public bicycles, and disaster response team…etc.

(3) Hsinchu City Police Department: all around services in local police stations.

(4) Taitung County Police Department: tourist policing, land conservation, integrated team to deal with sexual assaults.

3. Performances and public satisfaction

All four police departments set up goals to improve their services and conducted surveys to gauge public satisfaction, as described below:

(1) Taoyuan County Police Department: In 2008, the police department was the No. 1 recipient in multiple national evaluations. The average time to arrive the scenes was 6.10 minutes, about 3.52 minutes (or 37%) fewer than the 9.61 minutes average in 2007. Regarding public satisfaction, 78.86% of the civilians expressed “satisfied” in 2008, a 5.49% jump from 71.37% in 2007.

(2) Taichung County Police Department: In 2009, the average time to arrive the scenes went from 12 minutes to 6 minutes (a 50% reduction). A total of 126 online services were provided which resulted in a 142% increase from 2008. The number of online applications rose
to 3350 cases, up 32% from 2008. In terms of public satisfaction, in Q4 of 2009 the department recorded a 79.09% rating which was 4.62% higher than the 74.47% mark in Q3 of 2008.

(3) **Hsinchu City Police Department**: In 2010, the average time to arrive the scenes was 4 minutes 10 seconds, a 30-second (or 12%) improvement over 2009. The setup of local area network saved roughly 13.5 million NTD annually. Regarding public satisfaction, 81.45% of the civilians expressed “satisfied” in Q3 of 2010 which was a new high in four years and was 5.35% higher than Q4 of 2009.

(4) **Taitung County Police Department**: In 2011, the average time to arrive the scenes was 6 minutes 39 seconds, well within the 10-minute target. The department also pioneered the on-site pickups of police criminal record certificates, saving total traveling distance by 13256 km. Its performances in countering land destruction, illegal logging, and illegal usages of hillside lands all ranked No.1 among the nation. The clear-up rate of sexual assault cases went up by 6%, and the number of days taken was reduced by 18%. In terms of public satisfaction, the department received an 83.52% score in 2010, which was higher than the national average for four consecutive years.

**Assessment and analysis**

The public service of all four police departments lacked of quality assessment and analysis so that it is limited by the traditional performance evaluation requesting the performance of each department. This can be proved by the core business such as joining the duty of local police station, the maintenance of public security, and traffic management in each police department from “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” by Executive Yuen. The performance of Taoyuan County Police Department is an excellent example. The department not only strengthened public service, but actively pursued theft prevention project, and fraud investigation, and the arrangement of the project for the performance requested by the senior agencies. Furthermore, Taitung County Police Department actively established the procedures for high quality service, such as organization diagnosis, data collection, identifying problems and formulating solutions, developing a sense of community, cross-border exchanges and cooperation, outcomes assessment, and the processing the cycle of quality management which seems closer to the practice of quality management.

**Training and incentive**

The public service of four police departments all lacked of quality training and incentive mechanism. Taichung County Police took advantage of year-round training opportunities, taught by the department chief with "customer-oriented” concept. Hsinchu City and Taitung County Police Departments strengthened police’s empathy and training of excellent service attitude, but the training hours were not enough and lack of systematic training; others, such as Hsinchu City Police Department police officers commending the police for good deeds and rewarding those who actively served people were sporadic approaches.
Comparisons: Quality Management of Policing in Taiwan and U.S.

1. Systems and Organizations

   In the U.S., the Federal Quality Institute leads the way in promoting quality management and the President’s Quality Award has been established to recognize outstanding federal organizations. The reward system, however, does not include local government agencies and the states own the rights to make laws based on their police power. Local police departments can thus retain the autonomy to a certain extent and develop unique styles despite being influenced by federal movements. On the other hand, Taiwan government has adopted the conventional top-down approach in promoting public services and all levels of government are under its control. Local police departments in Taiwan have been following the Executive Yuan’s “Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan” to operate under a centralized government system and consequently, all the police departments resemble each other.

   Moreover, the concept of total quality management hinges on “culture development” to continually improve the systems (Denhardt & Grubbs, 1999; Morgan & Murgatroyd, 1994; Rosenbloom & Kravchuk, 2002). In the U.S., long-term tenures enable chiefs of local police to patiently promote quality management through step-by-step organizational development to achieve complete and effective results. Contrastingly, the progress of public services by local police departments in Taiwan is limited by the 2-3 year tenures. Chiefs of police often try to show quality management improvement within their tenures in order to earn the recognition from “Government Service Quality Award”. It is observed that this flawed system has led to the demises of several ongoing policies with the departures of police chiefs. As a result, the “willingness” to establish quality management has never developed into a more consistent built-in “culture”.

2. Approaches to Quality Management

   Case Study in U.S.: Brighton Police Department and Madison Police Department

   (1). Senior Leadership: Service quality improvement at both police departments was supported by senior leaders.

   (2). Strategic Planning: Madison Police Department has a committee that does strategic planning, while Brighton Police Department lacks of similar functionaries.

   (3). Customer Focus: Both police departments provide customer-oriented services based on customer needs.

   (4). Measurement and Analysis: Both police departments systematically measure customer satisfaction through information analysis and both improve organizational management.

   (5). Training and Reward: Both police departments emphasize training and reward systems.

   (6). Delegation and Teamwork: Madison Police Department has gone through reorganization to improve service quality management. Brighton Police Department does not show as much delegation or teamwork in its structure.
Quality Assurance: Brighton Police Department guarantees its service credibility while Madison Police Department lacks of similar quality assurance.

**Case Study in Taiwan: Four Locations**

1. Senior Leadership: Service quality improvement at four local police departments was supported by senior leaders.
2. Strategic Planning: Out of the four police departments, only Taitung County Police Department does strategic planning.
3. Customer Focus: All four police departments fall short of the expectations to provide customer-oriented services despite routinely holding community safety meetings.
4. Measurement and Analysis: Out of the four police departments, only Taitung County Police Department has established service prototype and quality standard. Others have yet to develop a more systematic and methodical way of process measurement.
5. Training and Reward: All four police departments lack of training and reward programs.
6. Delegation and Teamwork: All four police departments need to come up with effective delegation and better teamwork.
7. Quality Assurance: All four police departments lack of quality assurance.

In summary, the similarities and differences between U.S. and Taiwan police departments in promoting quality management are included in table 3.

3. Service Performance and Satisfaction

In the U.S., the evaluation of quality management in police departments consists of a wide range of criteria, including the satisfaction of internal and external customers. The assessment by local governors, congresspersons, and media members all count in the evaluation. On the other hand, the evaluation of police departments in Taiwan is more tilted toward the satisfaction of external customers, specifically the public’s satisfaction. Regarding overall service performance and satisfaction, both the U.S. and Taiwan have shown improvement in quality management.

**Conclusion: Seeking for “Good Governance”**

In conclusion, the implementation of Total Quality Management in Taiwan and America in order to increase the public satisfaction and service performance was the business-like reforms of governmental management that under the influence of “new public management” after 1980s. Based on the research of public administration scholars, public organizations introduced the methods of private sector management including pros and cons which need a further discussion.

**The Reflection on Total Quality Management of Police Agencies**

From the scholar’s research, as Total Quality Management used properly, it indeed lead to a higher service quality and lower costs, which improved customer satisfaction, staff morale and
opportunities for employees to participate in decision-making. However, the way of management could lead to challenges such as employees' resistance to change, the policy mistakes, the conflict of power and multiple needs, leader’s role and terms, and sustained improvements difficultly, possibly resulted in defeat (吳瓊恩、李允傑、陳銘薰，2005：117-119；Hunt,1993; Morgan&Murgatroyd,1994).

In practice, the experiences of Total Quality Management implemented by the police department in Taiwan and U.S. proved this method indeed led to a higher satisfaction and performance on service for police agencies. Nevertheless, Taiwan’s performance was relatively limited due to the fact that the implementation of Total Quality Management in Taiwan’s police departments had not completely adopted the methods and steps of Total Quality Management, especially the principles of customer-oriented, continuous improvement and team work (江岷欽、林鍾沂，1999：419).

Secondly, we agrees that if Total Quality Management used properly, its benefits outweigh its costs and while the use of new public management is popular in various nations, it seems to be a useful tool for modern government reforms, but the we still has to objectively understand the limitation of the value of foundational concept and practices. That is, while on the position of the new public management emphasizes the feedback of market and entrepreneurship and takes citizens as the customers of government in pursuit of customer’s satisfaction, we still must perceive that citizens not just the customers, they are also the masters of government. When pursuing the customer satisfaction, we can not ignore the responsiveness and values such as fairness and justice in civil society (Denhardt&Grubbs,1999). This is perhaps the reason for the rising of the thoughts and methods of New Governance such as "Good Governance." (陳金貴，2013：33-35)

Seeking for “Good Governance” of Police Agencies

As above mentioned, after 2007, the implementation of public service in Taiwan government is the continuation of the service quality practices. Besides, on the reference of the concept of “Good Governance” implemented in advanced countries, the government led administrative organizations transform into a full-service government by "Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan." “Good Governance” was implemented by Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, OECD, Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, APEC and other international organizations. In addition, the quality of life and economic development in every nation are promoted through the introduction of the principle of good governance and regular public governance investigation for countries to promote. Taiwan Public Governance Research Center was commissioned by RDEC to establish a set of index framework based on the reference of the principles drawn up by the international organizations to measure the Taiwan public governance. The purpose is to select seven dimensions and measurement systems such as the degree of legislation, government effectiveness, government responsiveness, government transparency, corruption forbidding, accountability and public participation, and
further understand and track the Taiwan overall status of public governance, as the reference for government to improve policy (宋餘俠、黃子華，2009：20、21).

The concept of “Good Governance” from advanced countries introduced by Executive Yuan for implementing the public service in every administrative organization was an innovation, which was also different from the implementation of quality management in U.S. Thus, there was a discrepancy between the implementation of quality management in Taiwan and American police agencies. The frameworks of "Government Service Innovation and Advancement Plan" from Executive Yuan included five dimensions such as the content of service, transparent process, customer relationships, information communication and integrated service. The frameworks also comprised the concept of good governance, including government effectiveness, government responsiveness, transparency of government, and public participation as well as the values of effectiveness, responsiveness, and fair justice. Consequently, these practices had the positive effect to enhance all of the public services in every administrative organization and the future was expected.

Table 3: The implementation of quality management in Taiwan and U.S. police departments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The method of quality management</th>
<th>The police departments in Taiwan and U.S</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brighton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Leadership</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Planning</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer-oriented</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment and analysis</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and incentive</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>employees’ empowerment and team-work</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality guarantee</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Resources: the author made
王國明研究主持，1997，後續警政建設方案之評估，台北：行政院研考會。
內政部警政署，2002，內政部警政署推動警察機關導入ISO品質管理系統暨驗證工作指導
計畫，台北：內政部警政署。
台中縣警察局，2010，第二屆政府服務品質獎參獎申請書，台中縣：台中縣警察局。
台東縣警察局，2012，第四屆政府服務品質獎參獎申請書，台東：台東縣警察局。
江岷欽，林鍾沂，1999，公共組織理論，台北：台中大學。
朱金池，1999，「警政品質管理之研究」，收錄於Golembiewski、孫本初、江岷欽編，公共管理論文精選(I)，台北：元照，343-366。
行政院，2007，政府服務創新精進方案，台北：行政院。
行政院研考會，2009，第一屆政府服務品質獎評獎紀實，台北：行政院研考會。
行政院研考會，2010，第二屆政府服務品質獎評獎紀實，台北：行政院研考會。
行政院研考會，2011，第三屆政府服務品質獎評獎紀實，台北：行政院研考會。
行政院研考會，2012，第四屆政府服務品質獎評獎紀實，台北：行政院研考會。
李涓清、黃啟賓，2007，「現階段政府為民服務推動工作之變革與展望」，研考雙月刊，31卷4期，13-28。
陳明傳，2000，警察行政專題(二)，桃園龜山：中央警察大學。
陳明傳、孟維德譯，D. C. Couper & S. H. Lobitz原著，1995，警政品質管理——麥迪遜市之經驗，桃園龜山：中央警察大學。
陳家聲，2010，「「政府機關創新服務模式之探討」，研考雙月刊，34卷5期，30-38。
章光明，2011，警察政策，桃園龜山：中央警察大學。
章光明等合著，2010，政策與管理，桃園龜山：中央警察大學。
楊德輝譯，石原勝吉原著，1991，服務業的品質管理(上、下)，台北：經濟部國貿局。
新竹市警察局，2011，第三屆政府服務品質獎參獎申請書，新竹市：新竹市警察局。
廖麗娟、黃啟賓，2010，「提升政府服務品質策略之探討」，研考雙月刊，34卷5期，12-25。
廖麗娟、黃啟賓，2012，「政府精進創新整合服務之策略」，研考雙月刊，36卷5期，15-26。
劉毓鈴研究主持，2012，公共服務創新策略與評核機制之研究，台北：行政院研考會。
劉毓鈴研究主持，2012，公共服務創新策略與評核機制之研究，台北：行政院研考會。
Golembiewski, R. T. (陈衍宏译)，1999，「全面品質之核心工作」，收录於 Golembiewski、孙本初、江岷欽编，公共管理論文精选(1)，台北：元照，433-445。
行政院研考會，「政府服務品質獎」網站：http://www.rdec.gov.tw/mp160.htm。

**English**


Snyder,Dowd&Houghton,1994
